

Regulation mechanisms of smart tourism development in Kazakhstan

Assemkul Mussabayeva¹, Lyailya Mutaliyeva¹, Gulzhan Abdramanova¹, Botagoz Akhtayeva¹,
Bauyrzhan Zhadigerov¹, Tansel Tercan², Mafura Uandykova³, Alexey Y. Mikhaylov^{4,*}, Vera Ivanyuk^{4,5,6}

¹ L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Astana 010000, Kazakhstan

² Rixos President Astana Hotel, Astana 010000, Kazakhstan

³ School of Digital Technologies, Narxoz University, Almaty 050035, Kazakhstan

⁴ Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation, 125167 Moscow, Russia

⁵ Western Caspian University, Baku AZ 1001, Republic of Azerbaijan

⁶ Baku Eurasian University, Baku AZ 1073, Republic of Azerbaijan

* **Corresponding author:** Alexey Y. Mikhaylov, alexeyfa@ya.ru

CITATION

Mussabayeva A, Mutaliyeva L, Abdramanova G, et al. (2024). Regulation mechanisms of smart tourism development in Kazakhstan. *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*. 8(13): 8834. <https://doi.org/10.24294/jipd8834>

ARTICLE INFO

Received: 27 August 2024

Accepted: 12 September 2024

Available online: 18 November 2024

COPYRIGHT



Copyright © 2024 by author(s). *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development* is published by EnPress Publisher, LLC. This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license. <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Abstract: The process of digitalization within the realm of tourism is not merely a trend but rather a significant catalyst that is rapidly propelling the comprehensive transformation of the tourism industry into a new era of technological advancement. This intricate process fundamentally involves the seamless integration and application of cutting-edge digital technologies across various tourism-related activities and services. The advent of innovative solutions that harness the immense capabilities of artificial intelligence, the analytical power of big data, the security features of blockchain, and the interconnectedness provided by the Internet of Things primarily serves to enhance the overall quality of services offered, optimize pricing strategies to align with market demands, and improve risk management protocols within the industry. This paper methods uses 100 Scopus indexed papers about Smart Tourism Development in Kazakhstan. It is imperative to underscore the fact that the ongoing digitalization process, while offering numerous advantages, simultaneously imposes rigorous new requirements concerning the qualifications and competencies of staff members, as well as the paramount importance of data security measures and the protection of consumer rights in the digital environment. The effective management of this digital transformation necessitates a holistic and integrated approach that encompasses not only the development of robust infrastructure but also the enhancement of digital literacy among employees and the establishment of a dynamic and innovative ecosystem that encourages creativity and adaptability.

Keywords: social research; tourism; Kazakhstan; state regulation

1. Introduction

Furthermore, it is essential to recognize that digitalization mandates a certain degree of flexibility from businesses operating within the tourism sector, as they must be willing and able to adapt to the new digital landscape. In order to facilitate a smooth transition to digital platforms, it is crucial to ensure that there is a reliable and robust infrastructure in place, as well as to prioritize the training and development of digital skills among personnel to meet the evolving demands of the industry. Moreover, the advent of virtual and augmented reality technologies has the remarkable potential to create immersive emotional experiences, thereby enabling prospective tourists to virtually explore and interact with their desired destinations from the comfort of their own homes. Additionally, the implementation of blockchain technology offers a myriad of advantages, including the provision of secure and transparent transactions,

which in turn bolsters trust and enhances efficiency in the processes of booking and payment within the tourism sector. (Yesbergen et al., 2022; Zhamiyeva et al., 2022; Zhanbayev et al., 2023; Zhang et al., 2023; Zhunussova et al., 2020).

The research gap is Regulation Mechanisms of Smart Tourism Development in Kazakhstan.

The contemporary paradigm known as Tourism 4.0 represents an innovative approach to the comprehensive analysis and processing of extensive data accumulated through meticulous investigations of a multitude of tourist destinations, with the ultimate objective of establishing a highly personalized informational ecosystem pertaining to tourism resources. This advanced concept of Tourism 4.0 can be systematically categorized into four distinct yet interrelated components: innovations, technologies, environment, and applications, which may be conceptually depicted as a model that draws upon the underlying principles and mechanisms inherent in Industry 4.0, thereby fostering the enhancement and growth of various tourist destinations and facilitating the formulation of an effective tourism policy through the means of digitalization and the automation of numerous processes. The significance of this concept lies in its foundational role in the establishment and transition towards a novel economic landscape, which empowers stakeholders to reevaluate the service sector by adopting a perspective that views it through the lens of a sophisticated technological platform (Kuatova et al., 2020; Kulanov et al., 2020; Kuzhabekova, 2020; Lakbayev et al., 2020; Li et al., 2023; Linnenluecke and McKnight, 2017; Majeed and Jamshed, 2023).

In regard to the current state of tourism endeavors within Kazakhstan, particularly in the context of digitalization, it is pertinent to note that the domestic tourism market is estimated to encompass approximately 6 to 8 million individuals annually. Nevertheless, it is important to highlight that the proportion of online transactions for travel services remains remarkably low, which serves as a clear indicator of the substantial potential for growth and expansion within this sector. To illustrate this point further, roughly 400 thousand individuals engage in the procurement of air tickets via online platforms, a statistic that underscores the nascent stage of the shift towards digital purchasing behaviors. Alarming, only a mere 2 to 3 percent of tourist destinations within Kazakhstan are capable of attracting foreign visitors, which consequently elucidates the pressing necessity for the development of a more sophisticated and diverse array of tourist offerings (Osiyevskyy and Dewald, 2018; Ozenbayeva et al., 2022; Pan et al., 2020; Petrenko et al., 2020; Pieper, 2021; Rapposelli et al., 2023; Seitzhanov et al., 2020; Serebrennikova et al., 2020; Shaimenova et al., 2020; Singh et al., 2023; Siregar et al., 2004; Soltangazinov et al., 2020; Song et al., 2023; Stepanova et al., 2024; Taleb, 1998; Tang and Chen, 2014; Tasmaganbetov et al., 2020; Teng and Shang, 2018; Tutumlu and Rustemov, 2021; Wang et al., 2023a).

2. Related literature

The expansion of online sales is widely acknowledged as one of the most significant factors that contribute to the overall advancement of the market, which includes not only the collaboration between various companies aimed at fostering

market development but also entails a thorough comparison with international best practices, as well as a concerted effort to enhance the quality of tourism services and the infrastructure that supports them. The eQonaq system, which has been implemented in Kazakhstan, stands as a paramount example of the successful integration of digital technologies within the tourism sector, playing a crucial role in both elevating the standard of tourist services and enhancing the efficiency with which tourist flows are managed, alongside migration control measures (Akhmetzharov and Orazgaliyev, 2021; Alimkhanova, 2020; Altynbassov et al., 2020; Amirbekova et al., 2022; An and Mikhaylov, 2020; An et al., 2024; An, Mikhaylov et al., 2020; Ashurov et al., 2020; Akhmetov and Howie, 2024; Baldakhov and Heim, 2020; Batten et al., 2019; Baubekova et al., 2021; Bespalyy, 2021; Bonato et al., 2020; Bouri, 2023; Boute, 2020; Buribayev et al., 2021; Butova et al., 2022; Chatzis et al., 2018).

The first area of impact is that the eQonaq system significantly streamlines the process involved in the registration of foreign tourists, thereby relieving foreign nationals from the obligation of having to physically visit the migration police for such purposes. This particular functionality not only dramatically reduces the administrative burden placed upon both the tourists themselves and the employees working within hotels but also serves to increase the overall convenience and allure of Kazakhstan as a preferred tourist destination, ultimately making it more appealing for international visitors.

The second notable aspect pertains to the eQonaq system's capability to collect, analyze, and interpret data regarding the movements of tourists, which provides invaluable insights for government agencies and businesses operating within the tourism sector, enabling them to make well-informed decisions regarding the planning and development of tourism products, as well as necessary improvements in both infrastructure and service offerings (Wang et al., 2023b; Wang et al., 2023c; Werner and Sotskov, 2006; Xu and Shang, 2018; Xu et al., 2018; Yerkinbayeva et al., 2021).

The third area of focus revolves around the enhancement of security measures; the system is designed to deliver effective migration control.

The domain we are examining includes not only the enhancement of service quality provided by hotels but also the capacity for conducting comprehensive marketing research to identify emerging trends and preferences among tourists. It also establishes a conducive environment for the overall growth of the tourism sector, thereby augmenting its competitive edge on an international scale (Chikanayev, 2021; Cui and Maghyreh, 2023; De Clerk and Savelev, 2021; Doern, 2016; Finta and Aboura, 2020; Gulis et al., 2021; Guliyev, 2024; Howie et al., 2020; Jiang et al., 2018; Jiang et al., 2019; Jun et al., 2017; Janenova and Knox, 2020; Junussova and Beimisheva, 2021; Kassenova, 2020; Khamitov et al., 2023; Khamzina et al., 2020; Kinatader and Papavassiliou, 2019; Kratz, 2019; Krugman, 1979; Igaliyeva et al., 2020).

3. Materials and methods

This paper methods uses 100 Scopus indexed papers about Smart Tourism Development in Kazakhstan (Mandal and Thakur, 2023; Mei et al., 2017; Mikhaylov, 2021; Mikhaylov, 2023; Mikhaylov et al., 2023a; Mikhaylov et al., 2023b; Mitskaya,

2020; Moiseev et al., 2023; Movkebayeva et al., 2021; Mutalimov et al., 2021; Nukusheva et al., 2023; Nurgozhayeva, 2020; Omirbayev et al., 2021) (**Tables 1 and 2**).

Table 1. Methodological process for searching and selecting the articles.

State	Research quantity	Target words	Timeframe
Kazakhstan	42	Smart tourism	2007–2024
United States	17	Smart tourism	2007–2024
EU	14	Smart tourism	2007–2024
China	10	Smart tourism	2007–2024
Russia	10	Smart tourism	2007–2024
Kyrgyzstan	3	Smart tourism	2007–2024
Uzbekistan	2	Smart tourism	2007–2024
Tajikistan	2	Smart tourism	2007–2024

Source: authors.

The methodology is described properly in the next papers (Aday et al., Izatullayeva et al., 2024; Matyusupov et al., 2024; Moldagaliyeva et al., 2024; Rakhimov and Kobilov, 2024; Rakhimov and Kobilov, 2024; Tsapova et al., 2024; Tassilova et al., 2024; Uaisova, 2024; Urdabayev et al., 2024; Yessimova et al., 2024).

Table 2. High citable papers about smart tourism.

State	Authors	Target words	Timeframe
Kazakstan	Uaisova, 2024	Smart tourism	2007–2024
Kazakstan	Moldagaliyeva et al. 2024	Smart tourism	2007–2024
Kazakstan	Aday et al. 2024	Smart tourism	2007–2024
Kazakstan	Yessimova et al. 2024	Smart tourism	2007–2024
Kazakstan	Rakhimov and Kobilov 2024	Smart tourism	2007–2024

Source: authors.

4. Results

On the date of 30 September 2023, the remarkable milestone of registering the millionth tourist was achieved within the highly efficient eQonaq information system, which has been instrumental in tracking and managing tourist data. Among the various nationalities represented within the tourist demographic, it has been observed that individuals hailing from both Russia and Uzbekistan are leading the way in their utilization of this modern system, thereby sharing the prestigious first position in terms of engagement.

Notably, the city of Almaty has emerged as the most popular destination for foreign visitors, attracting a remarkable total of 343 thousand tourists, while the capital city of Astana follows closely behind with 174 thousand tourists recorded. Additionally, the top five regions that have garnered significant attention include the Almaty region, which welcomed 62 thousand tourists, as well as the Atyrau region, which hosted 58 thousand tourists, and the Mangystau region, which saw an influx of

52 thousand tourists. This data underscores the regional appeal of these areas and highlights the growing interest in Kazakhstan as a whole.

The eQonaq information system has proven to be a transformative tool, providing substantial enhancements in the efficiency of processing data related to foreign tourists, thus streamlining the entire experience. Specifically, this innovative system has facilitated a more straightforward registration process for hotels accommodating foreign guests, effectively eliminating the previous necessity for an extensive number of 287 guests to make a visit to the migration police for formal registration. Currently, over a thousand accommodations have successfully integrated their operations with this efficient system, reflecting its broad acceptance and implementation within the hospitality industry.

Since the inception of the eQonaq system, an impressive cumulative total of 1,829,733 tourists have been officially registered, signifying its effectiveness and widespread usage. In the month of September 2023 alone, there were approximately 118 thousand notifications recorded, which serves as a compelling indicator of a notable increase in both tourist inflow and overall activity within the tourism sector across Kazakhstan. This upward trend is indicative of a revitalized interest in exploring the country as a tourist destination.

Moreover, the eQonaq system adeptly addresses and eliminates the traditionally lengthy registration procedures that have previously plagued the industry, resulting in a significant reduction in waiting times and an overall simplification of the process for both guests and hotel staff alike. Furthermore, it enhances the migration control procedures, thereby contributing positively to the overall experience of foreign tourists during their stay in Kazakhstan.

In a broader context, the advent of the eQonaq system within Kazakhstan's tourism sector represents a significant leap forward in the realms of digitalization and the simplification of tourist-related protocols. The adoption of such a digital system not only enriches the overall tourist experience of visiting this beautiful country but also serves to stimulate growth within the tourism industry, consequently positioning Kazakhstan as a more appealing destination for global travellers seeking new adventures.

5. Conclusions

In conclusion, the digitalization of tourism within Kazakhstan stands as a pivotal direction for the ongoing development and enhancement of the national tourism sector's competitiveness on an international scale in personalizing offers, and effectively managing risks associated with tourism.

Innovative solutions such as the eQonaq system for monitoring foreign tourist activity not only demonstrate significant advancements in data processing but also facilitate the simplification of procedures for both tourists and hotel operators. Additionally, these developments contribute to the fortification of security measures and migration control protocols. Collectively, these changes enhance the appeal of Kazakhstan as a prime tourist destination, stimulate economic growth, and encourage the broader adoption of digital platforms within the local population and tourism enterprises alike. It is essential to recognize that the process of digitalization

necessitates that the industry adapt to emerging technologies, cultivate necessary skills, and establish a comprehensive legal framework aimed at ensuring data security and protecting consumer rights. The paper confirms that the smart tourism growth is very quick in Kazakhstan now.

The future research directions are regulation Mechanisms of Smart Tourism Development in Russia and other countries.

Acknowledgments: Mafura Uandykova made research as a part of the project IRN AP19678174 on the topic «Development the theory and methodology for formation development programs of the RK during the transformation the economy into an innovative».

Conflict of interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- Akhmetov, D., & Howie, P. (2024). Coal-based generators' corporate response to an emissions trading scheme in Kazakhstan. *Utilities Policy*, 90, 101797.
- Akhmetzharov, S., & Orazgaliyev, S. (2021). Labor unions and institutional corruption: The case of Kazakhstan. *Journal of Eurasian Studies*, 12(2), 133-144.
- Alimkhanova, S. K. (2020). Legal aspects of harmonization of labor legislation of Kazakhstan and the Eurasian economic union countries (EAEU). *Journal of Advanced Research in Law and Economics (JARLE)*, 11(50), 1080-1086.
- Altynbassov, B., Abdulkarimova, Z., Bayanbayeva, A., & Mukhamejanuly, S. (2020). Legal and organizational issues of the transformation of public universities into non-profit organizations in Kazakhstan. *Journal of Advanced Research in Law and Economics*, 3(49), 726-734.
- Amirbekova, D., Narbaev, T., & Kussaiyn, M. (2022). The research environment in a developing economy: Reforms, patterns, and challenges in Kazakhstan. *Publications*, 10(4), 37.
- An, J., Mikhaylov, A. (2020). Russian energy projects in South Africa. *Journal of Energy in Southern Africa*, 31(3), 58–64, <http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/2413-3051/2020/v31i3a7809>
- An, J., Mikhaylov, A., Chang, T. (2024). Relationship between the popularity of a platform and the price of NFT assets. *Finance Research Letters*, 61, 3, 105057, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.frl.2024.105057>
- An, J., Mikhaylov, A., Jung, S.-U. (2020). The Strategy of South Korea in the Global Oil Market. *Energies*, 13(10), 2491. <https://doi.org/10.3390/en13102491>
- Ashurov, S., Othman, A. H. A., Rosman, R. B., & Haron, R. B. (2020). The determinants of foreign direct investment in Central Asian region: A case study of Tajikistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan (A quantitative analysis using GMM). *Russian Journal of Economics*, 6(2), 162-176.
- Baldakhov, U., & Heim, I. (2020). Institutional reform in Kazakhstan. *Kazakhstan's Diversification from the Natural Resources Sector: Strategic and Economic Opportunities*, 3-29.
- Batten, J. A., Kinatader, H., Szilagyi, P. G., & Wagner, N. F. (2019). Hedging stocks with oil, *Energy Econ.*, 104422.
- Baubekova, A., Tikhonova, A., & Kvasha, A. (2021). Evolution of agricultural policy in Kazakhstan. *Kazakhstan's Developmental Journey: Entrenched Paradigms, Achievements, and the Challenge of Global Competitiveness*, 51-90.
- Bespalyy, S. (2021). Kazakhstan: Assessment of renewable energy support and a green economy. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism (JEMT)*, 12(03 (51)), 631-641.
- Bonato, M., Gupta, R., Marco, C. K., & Wang, L. S. (2020). Moments-based spillovers across gold and oil markets. *Energy Economics*.
- Bouri, E. (2023). Spillovers in the joint system of conditional higher-order moments: US evidence from green energy, brown energy, and technology stocks. *Renewable Energy*, 210, 507-523.
- Boute, A. (2020). Regulatory stability and renewable energy investment: The case of Kazakhstan. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 121, 109673.

- Buribayev, Y., Khamzina, Z., Suteeva, C., Yermukanov, Y., Turlykhankyzy, K., & Kuttygalieva, A. (2021). Analysis of the possibilities for improving the environmental legislation of kazakhstan. *Fronteiras*, 10(3), 78-88.
- Butova, T., Varzin, V., Niyazbekova, S., Yessymkhanova, Z., & Anzorova, S. (2022, May). Effectiveness of Regulatory Mechanisms of the Oil and Gas Industry in the Context of Environmental Problems. In *International Scientific Conference on Agricultural Machinery Industry "Interagromash"* (pp. 38-49). Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Chatzis, S. P., Siakoulis, V., Petropoulos, A., Stavroulakis, E., & Vlachogiannakis, N. (2018). Forecasting stock market crisis events using deep and statistical machine learning techniques. *Expert Systems Applications*, 112, 353–371.
- Chikanayev, S. (2021). Public–Private partnerships in Kazakhstan: evolution of the government policy and reality of PPP deployment. *Kazakhstan’s Developmental Journey: Entrenched Paradigms, Achievements, and the Challenge of Global Competitiveness*, 153-180., 12235.
- Cui, J., & Maghyreh, A. (2023). Time-frequency dependence and connectedness among global oil markets: fresh evidence from higher-order moment perspective. *Journal of Commodity Markets*, 30, 100323.
- De Clerk, L., & Savel'ev, S. (2021). An investigation of higher order moments of empirical financial data series, arXiv preprint, arXiv:2103.13199.
- Doern, R. (2016). Entrepreneurship and crisis management: The experiences of small businesses during the London 2011 riots. *International Small Business Journal*, 34 (3), 276–302.
- Finta, M. A., & Aboura, S. (2020). Risk premium spillovers among stock markets: evidence from higher-order moments. *J. Financ. Mark.*
- Gulis, G., Aringazina, A., Sangilbayeva, Z., Kalel, Z., de Leeuw, E., & Allegrante, J. P. (2021). Population health status of the Republic of Kazakhstan: trends and implications for public health policy. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 18(22)
- Guliyev, F. (2024). Renewable energy targets and policies in traditional oil-producing countries: A comparison of Azerbaijan and Kazakhstan. *Journal of Eurasian Studies*, 15(1), 110-124.
- Howie, P., Gupta, S., Park, H., & Akmetov, D. (2020). Evaluating policy success of emissions trading schemes in emerging economies: comparing the experiences of Korea and Kazakhstan. *Climate policy*, 20(5), 577-592.
- Igaliyeva, L., Yegemberdiyeva, S., Utepkaliyeva, K., & Bakirbekova, A. (2020). Development of economic mechanism for ensuring ecological security in Kazakhstan. *International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy*, 10(4), 240-250.
- Janenova, S., & Knox, C. (2020). Combatting corruption in Kazakhstan: A role for ethics commissioners?. *Public Administration and Development*, 40(3), 186-195.
- Jiang, J., Shang, P., Zhang, Z., & Li, X. (2018). The multi-scale high-order statistical moments of financial time series. *Physica A.*, 512, 474–488.
- Jiang, X., Han, L., & Yin, L. (2019). Can skewness predict currency excess returns? *N. Am. J. Econ. Finance*, 48, 628–641.
- Jun, D., Ahn, C., & Kim, G. (2017). Analysis of the global financial crisis using statistical moments. *Finance Research Letters*, 21, 47–52.
- Junussova, M., & Beimisheva, A. (2021). Monotowns of Kazakhstan: Development challenges and opportunities. *Kazakhstan’s developmental journey: Entrenched paradigms, achievements, and the challenge of global competitiveness*, 211-247.
- Kassenova, N. (2020). Kazakhstan’s adaptation to the belt and road initiative: tracing changes in domestic governance. In *The Belt and Road Initiative and Global Governance* (pp. 182-203). Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Khamitov, Z., Knox, C., & Junusbekova, G. (2023). Corruption, public procurement and political instability in Kazakhstan. *Central Asian Survey*, 42(1), 89-108.
- Khamzina, Z., Buribayev, Y., Yermukanov, Y., & Alshurazova, A. (2020). Is it possible to achieve gender equality in Kazakhstan: Focus on employment and social protection. *International Journal of Discrimination and the Law*, 20(1), 5-20.
- Kinateder, H., & Papavassiliou, V. G. (2019). Sovereign bond return prediction with realized higher moments. *Journal of International Financial Markets, Institutions & Money*, 62, 53–73.
- Kratz, M. (2019). Introduction to extreme value theory: applications to risk analysis & management. In *2017 MATRIX Annals*, Springer, Cham, 591–636.
- Krugman, P. (1979). Increasing returns, monopolistic competition, and international trade. *J. Int. Econ.*, 9, 469–479.
- Kuatova, A., Bekbasarova, T., & Abdrashev, R. (2020). Introducing E-Government in Kazakhstan: The Concept of E-Democracy for the State-Public Interaction. In *Toward Sustainability Through Digital Technologies and Practices in the Eurasian Region* (pp. 1-16). IGI Global.

- Kulanov, A., Tamenova, S., Amenova, K., Karshalova, A., & Tussupova, L. (2020). Investment climate and its influence on the development of entrepreneurship: practice of the Republic of Kazakhstan. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 8(2), 421.
- Kuzhabekova, A. L. I. Y. A. (2020). Internationalization as a mechanism of higher education modernization in Kazakhstan. *The Bloomsbury handbook of the internationalization of higher education in the global south*, 100.
- Lakbayev, K. S., Rysmagambetova, G. M., Umetov, A. U., & Sysoyev, A. K. (2020). The crimes in the field of high technology: Concept, problems and methods of counteraction in Kazakhstan. *International Journal of Electronic Security and Digital Forensics*, 12(4), 412-423.
- Li, R., Wang, Q., Han, X. & Yang, X. (2023). Trajectory and drivers of China's consumption-based and production-based renewable energy consumption. *Energy Strategy Reviews* 47, 101083, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.esr.2023.101083>.
- Linnenluecke, M. K., & McKnight, B. (2017). Community resilience to natural disaster: The role of disaster entrepreneurship. *Journal of Enterprising Communities: People and Places in the Global Economy*, 11(1), 166–185.
- Majeed, N., Jamshed, S. (2023). Heightening citizenship behaviours of academicians through transformational leadership: Evidence based interventions. *Qual Quant* 57 (Suppl 4), 575–606. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-021-01146-2> 122219.
- Mandal, P. K., & Thakur, M. (2023). Higher-order moments in portfolio selection problems: A comprehensive literature review. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 121625.
- Mei, D., Liu, J., Ma, F., & Chen, W. (2017). Forecasting stock market volatility: Do realized skewness and kurtosis help? *Physica A.*, 481, 153–159.
- Mikhaylov, A. (2021). Development of Friedrich von Hayek's theory of private money and economic implications for digital currencies. *Terra Economicus*, 19(1), 53–62. <https://doi.org/10.18522/2073-6606-2021-19-1-53-62>
- Mikhaylov, A. (2023). Understanding the risks associated with wallets, depository services, trading, lending, and borrowing in the crypto space. *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*, 7(2), 2223. <https://doi.org/10.24294/jipd.v7i2.2223>
- Mikhaylov, A., Dinçer, H., & Yüksel, S. (2023a). Analysis of financial development and open innovation oriented fintech potential for emerging economies using an integrated decision-making approach of MF-X-DMA and golden cut bipolar q-ROFSs. *Financial Innovation*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40854-022-00399-6>
- Mikhaylov, A., Dinçer, H., Yüksel, S., et al. (2023b). Bitcoin mempool growth and trading volumes: Integrated approach based on QROF Multi-SWARA and aggregation operators. *Journal of Innovation & Knowledge*, 8(3), 100378. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jik.2023.100378>
- Mitskaya, E. (2020). Theoretical thoughts on legal regulation of mediation in criminal process in Kazakhstan. *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, 15(1), 91-113.
- Moiseev, N., Mikhaylov, A., Dinçer, H., et al. (2023). Market capitalization shock effects on open innovation models in e-commerce: golden cut q-rung orthopair fuzzy multicriteria decision-making analysis. *Financial Innovation*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40854-023-00461-x>
- Movkebayeva, Z., Khamitova, D., Zholtayeva, A., Balmagambetova, V., & Balabiyev, K. (2021). Factors influencing the legal regulation and management of education system in Kazakhstan: a review and analysis. *Problems and Perspectives in Management*, 18(4), 14.
- Mutalimov, V., Kovaleva, I., Mikhaylov, A., & Stepanova, D. (2021). Assessing regional growth of small business in Russia. *Entrepreneurial Business and Economics Review*, 9(3), 119-133, <https://doi.org/10.15678/EBER.2021.090308>
- Nukusheva, A., Rustembekova, D., Abdizhami, A., Au, T., & Kozhantayeva, Z. (2023). Regulatory obstacles in municipal solid waste management in Kazakhstan in comparison with the EU. *Sustainability*, 15(2), 1034.
- Nurgozhayeva, R. (2020). Rule-making, rule-taking or rule-rejecting under the belt and road initiative: a central Asian perspective. *The Chinese Journal of Comparative Law*, 8(1), 250-278.
- Omirbayev, S., Mukhatayev, A., Biloshchytskyi, A., & Kassenov, K. (2021). National model of the quality assurance of education in Kazakhstan: format, tools, and regulatory mechanisms. *Scientific Journal of Astana IT University*, 63-74.
- Osiyevskyy, O., & Dewald, J. (2018). The pressure cooker: when crisis stimulates explorative business model change intentions, *Long Range Plan.*, 51, 540–560.
- Ozenbayeva, A., Yerezhepyzy, R., Yessetova, S., Jangabulova, A., & Beissenbayeva, M. (2022). Legal regulation of transboundary water resources of the republic of Kazakhstan. *Environmental Development*, 44, 100781.
- Pan, G.-G., Shiu, Y.-M., & Wu, T.-C. (2020). Can risk-neutral skewness and kurtosis subsume the information content of historical jumps? *J. Financ. Mark.*

- Petrenko, Y., Denisov, I., Koshebayeva, G., & Biryukov, V. (2020). Energy efficiency of Kazakhstan enterprises: Unexpected findings. *Energies*, 13(5), 1055.
- Pieper, M. (2021). The linchpin of Eurasia: Kazakhstan and the Eurasian economic union between Russia's defensive regionalism and China's new Silk Roads. *International Politics*, 58(3), 462-482.
- Rapposelli, A., Birindelli, G. & Modina, M. (2023). The relationship between firm size and efficiency: why does default on bank loans matter?. *Qual Quant*, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-023-01810-9>
- Seitzhanov, S., Kurmanov, N., Petrova, M., Aliyev, U., & Aidargaliyeva, N. (2020). Stimulation of entrepreneurs' innovative activity: evidence from Kazakhstan. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability issues*, 7(4), 2615.
- Serebrennikova, A. V., Minyaseva, T. F., Kala, N. S., Malinovsky, A. A., Malinovskaya, V. M., & Grynchak, S. V. (2020). Comparative analysis of foundations of legal regulation of criminal liability for organ trafficking in the Russian Federation, Kazakhstan, and the European Union. *Journal of Advanced Research in Law and Economics*, 11(4 (50)), 1405-1415.
- Shaimenova, A., Ilyassova, G., Klyuyeva, Y., & Khashimova, A. (2020). Development of the institution of arbitration in Kazakhstan: Problems of theory and practice. *Journal of Advanced Research in Law and Economics*, 11(1), 169-86.
- Singh, R.K., Neuert, C.E. & Raykov, T. (2023). Assessing conceptual comparability of single-item survey instruments with a mixed-methods approach. *Qual Quant*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-023-01801-w>
- Siregar, R., Pontines, V., & Rajan, R. (2004). Extreme value theory and the incidence of currency crises. In *Econometric Society 2004 Australasian Meetings* (No. 181), Econometric Society.
- Soltangazinov, A., Smagulova, Z., Amirova, M., Kashuk, L., Karimbergenova, M., Kadyrova, A., & Zhaltyrova, O. (2020). Energy efficiency as a factor of sustainable development in Kazakhstan. *International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy*, 10(1), 325-330.
- Song, X., Wang, Q, Li, R. & Jiang, X.-t. (2023). A novel evaluation framework for China's Environmental-Economic impacts by global trade. *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 101, 107133, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eiar.2023.107133>.
- Stepanova, D., Yousif, N.B.A., Karlibaeva, R., Mikhaylov, A. (2024). Current analysis of cryptocurrency mining industry. *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*, 8(5), 4803. <https://doi.org/10.24294/jipd.v8i5.4803>
- Taleb, N. (1998). *Dynamic Hedging: Managing Vanilla and Exotic Options*, Wiley.
- Tang, Y., & Chen, P. (2014). Time varying moments, regime switch, and crisis warning: The birth–death process with changing transition probability. *Physica A.*, 404, 56–64.
- Tasmaganbetov, A. B., Imanbayeva, Z. O., Ataniyazov, Z., & Shaikin, D. N. (2020). Future development of price instruments of state support for the use of renewable energy sources in Kazakhstan. *International Journal of Energy Economics and Policy*, 10(1), 140-144.
- Teng, Y., & Shang, P. (2018). Detruded fluctuation analysis based on higher-order moments of financial time series. *Physica A.*, 490, 311–322.
- Tutumlu, A., & Rustemov, I. (2021). The Paradox of Authoritarian Power: Bureaucratic Games and Information Asymmetry. The Case of Nazarbayev's Kazakhstan. *Problems of Post-Communism*, 68(2), 124-134.
- Wang, Q, Guo, J., Li, R. & Jiang, X.-t. (2023a). Economic growth and carbon emission in the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development countries: The effects of oil, gas, and renewable energy. *Energy & Environment*, 0958305X221138817 (2023).
- Wang, Q, Hu, S., Li, L. & Li, R. (2023b). Accelerating urbanization serves to reduce income inequality without sacrificing energy efficiency—Evidence from the 78 countries. *Sustainable Cities and Society* 92, 104477 (2023).
- Wang, Q., Guo, J. & Li, R. (2023c). Spatial spillover effects of official development assistance on environmental pressure in sub-Saharan African (SSA) countries. *Geography and Sustainability* 4, 170-178, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geosus.2023.03.004> (2023).
- Werner, F., & Sotskov, Y. N. (2006). *Mathematics of Economics and Business*. London: Routledge, 61–106.
- Xu, M., & Shang, P. (2018). Analysis of financial time series using multiscale entropy based on skewness and kurtosis. *Physica A.*, 490, 1543–1550.
- Xu, S., Shao, M., Qiao, W., & Shang, P. (2018). Generalized AIC method based on higher-order moments and entropy of financial time series. *Physica A.*, 505, 1127–1138.
- Yerkinbayeva, L., Teleuyev, G., Kalymbek, B., Nurmukhankyzy, D., & Kuderina, A. (2021). Legal regulation of Kazakhstan's transition to the green economy. *Journal of Environmental Management & Tourism*, 12(5), 1335-1342.

- Yesbergen, R. A., Yessengaziyeva, S. K., & Asrepov, G. N. (2022). State regulation of agricultural industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan in conditions of VUCA-world. *Problems of AgriMarket*, 2, 71-77.
- Zhamiyeva, R., Sultanbekova, G., Balgimbekova, G., Mussin, K., Abzalbekova, M., & Kozhanov, M. (2022). Problems of the effectiveness of the implementation of international agreements in the field of waste management: the study of the experience of Kazakhstan in the context of the applicability of European legal practices. *International Environmental Agreements: Politics, Law and Economics*, 22(1), 177-199.
- Zhanbayev, R. A., Yerkin, A. Y., Shutaleva, A. V., Irfan, M., Gabelashvili, K., Temirbaeva, G. R. & Abdykadyrkyzy, R. (2023). State asset management paradigm in the quasi-public sector and environmental sustainability: Insights from the Republic of Kazakhstan. *Frontiers in Environmental Science*, 10, 1037023.
- Zhang, H., Jin, C., Bouri, E., Gao, W., & Xu, Y. (2023). Realized higher-order moments spillovers between commodity and stock markets: Evidence from China. *Journal of Commodity Markets*, 30, 100275.
- Zhunussova, G. Z., Ratner, S. V., Zhunussova, G. Z., Nurmukhanova, G. Z., & Shaihutdinova, A. K. (2020). Renewable energy in Kazakhstan: challenges and prospects. *International Energy Journal*, 20(3), 311-324.
- Urdabayev, M., Kireyeva, A., Vasa, L., Digel, I., Nurgaliyeva, K., & Nurbatsin, A. (2024). Discovering smart cities' potential in Kazakhstan: A cluster analysis. *Plos one*, 19(3), e0296765.
- Izatullayeva, B., Turkeyeva, E., & Kulbayeva, A. (2024). Improving the Importance of a Smart city in Achieving a Sustainable Tourism sector. *Eurasian Science Review An International peer-reviewed multidisciplinary journal*, 2(2), 76-86.
- Matyusupov, B., Khodjaniazov, E., Masharipova, M., & Gurbanov, F. (2024). The concepts of Smart cities, Smart Tourism Destination and Smart Tourism Cities and their interrelationship. In *BIO Web of Conferences* (Vol. 82, p. 06015). EDP Sciences.
- Tassilova, A., Tassilova, N., Zhappassov, Z. E., & Buyenbayeva, Z. (2024). THE HISTORY OF DIGITIZATION OF MODERN KAZAKHSTAN IN THE CONTEXT OF THE GLOBAL CHALLENGE: ANALYSIS AND COMPARISON. *Journal of History/Habarşy Tarihi Seriâsy*, 113(2).
- Uaisova, A., Yeleussinova, A., Askhat, G., & Dávid, L. D. (2024). Analysis and forecasting of the sacral tourism potential of Kazakhstan with a time series analysis. *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*, 8(6), 3435.
- Aday, A., Mazbayev, O., Tleubayeva, A., Amangeldi, A., & Han, F. (2024). KAZAKHSTAN TOURISM MARKET STRUCTURE ANALYSIS AND OPTIMIZATION PATH SELECTION. *Journal of Geography & Environmental Management*, 72(1).
- Moldagaliyeva, A., Aktymbayeva, A., Issakov, Y., Assylbekova, A., Kenzhalin, K., Beisembinova, A., ... & Dávid, L. D. (2024). SOCIO-ECONOMIC SIGNIFICANCE OF TOURISM DEVELOPMENT ON THE GREAT SILK ROAD (KAZAKHSTAN SECTION). *Geo Journal of Tourism and Geosites*, 52(1), 116-124.
- RAKHIMOV, A., & KoBILOV, F. (2024). THE EU's SoFT AND SMART APPROACHEs IN CENTRAL ASIA. *Himalayan & Central Asian Studies*, 28.
- Tsapova, O., Zhailaubayeva, S., Kendyukh, Y., Smolyaninova, S., & Abdulova, O. (2024). Industry Specifics and Problems of Digitalization in the Agro-industrial Complex of the Republic of Kazakhstan. *Journal of the Knowledge Economy*, 1-20.
- Yessimova, D., Faurat, A., Belyy, A., Yessim, A., Novikova, A., Olshanskaya, M., ... & Bumbak, S. V. (2024). ASSESSMENT OF THE READINESS OF THE TOURISM INDUSTRY IN THE PAVLODAR REGION FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF SUSTAINABLE TOURISM. *Geo Journal of Tourism and Geosites*, 54, 967-976.